a) 3/09/0270/FP and b) 3/09/0271/FP - Single storey extension to an existing outbuilding to provide auxiliary residential accommodation at <u>Goddards, Hunsdon Road, Widford, Herts, SG12 8SE for Mrs N Radford</u>

Date of Receipt: a) 23.02.09 b) 20.02.09 **Type:** a) Full b) Listed Building Consent

Parish: WIDFORD

Ward: HUNSDON

### RECOMMENDATION

- a) That in respect of application 3/09/0270/FP planning permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:-
  - 1. Three year time limit (1T121)
  - 2. Samples of materials (2E123)
  - The annexe hereby permitted shall not be occupied at any time other than for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the dwelling known as Goddards as identified on drawing no. 0133-400. Reason To ensure the Local Planning Authority retains control over any future residential development and in accordance with Policy ENV8 of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007.

### Summary of Reasons for Decision

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (East of England Plan May 2008, Hertfordshire County Structure Plan, Minerals Local Plan, Waste Local Plan and East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007), and in particular policies GBC3, ENV1, ENV5, ENV6, ENV8, BH1, BH6, BH12 and TR7. The balance of the considerations having regard to those policies is that permission should be granted.

- b) That in respect of application 3/09/0271/LB listed building consent be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:-
  - 1. Listed building three year time limit (1T141)
  - 2. Samples of materials (2E123)
  - 3. Listed building (new windows) (8L033)

- 4. Listed building (new doors) (8L043)
- 5. Listed building (new brickwork) (8L063)
- 6. Listed building (new rainwater goods) (8L093)
- 7. Listed building (making good) (8L103)

### Summary of Reasons for Decision

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (East of England Plan May 2008, Hertfordshire County Structure Plan, Minerals Local Plan, Waste Local Plan and East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007), and in particular policy BH10. The balance of the considerations having regard to that policy is that consent should be granted.

\_\_\_\_(027009FP.LD)

## 1.0 Background

- 1.1 The application site is located on the edge of the settlement of Widford and falls within the designated Widford Conservation Area, as shown on the attached OS extract.
- 1.2 The dwelling known as Goddards, is a Grade II Listed Building. The property is a large Georgian dwelling which has previously benefited from a large Victorian extension. The property is set within its own grounds and benefits from a large driveway at the front of the dwelling and a large rear garden which has benefited from landscaping and boundary treatment. To the North of the property is a detached double garage and garden store situated adjacent to the Northern boundary of the site. This garage and garden store is partially screened by a mature hedge which runs along the boundary of the application site.
- 1.3 The applications seek planning permission and listed building consent for the erection of a single storey extension to the existing outbuilding, which is curtilage listed, to provide ancillary residential accommodation. The existing outbuilding is 15.5 metres long and 4.7 metres deep and currently accommodates a utility room, two garages and garden store. The outbuilding is proposed to be extended with addition of an extension 11.0 metres long, 4.6 metres deep and 4.7 metres in height. This would result in an outbuilding that would be 26.5 metres long and 4.7 metres in depth. It should be noted that part of the existing outbuilding would be converted into a bedroom. The proposed extension would accommodate a second bedroom, living area, kitchen and bathroom.

1.4 These applications are being reported to Committee as they represents a departure from policy.

#### 2.0 <u>Site History</u>

2.1 The relevant planning history is as follows:-

LPA Reference	Description	Decision
3/95/0092/LB	Demolition of garden room and replacement by single storey (orangery) extension	Approved with conditions
3/95/0189/FP	Erection of single storey orangery to side of dwelling	Approved with conditions
3/01/0132/FP	New vehicular access	Approved with conditions
3/09/0477/FP	Detached pool house	Not yet determined.
		8 week date 22/05/09.

### 3.0 <u>Consultation Responses</u>

- 3.1 <u>County Highways</u> have commented that they do not wish to restrict the grant of planning permission subject to a condition ensuring that parking and storage of materials would be met on site during the construction stage. They have commented that the proposed development would not impact upon highway safety or capacity. Traffic generation is unlikely to rise significantly and sufficient parking and a vehicle turning area is available and existing vehicle access is of an adequate standard.
- 3.2 The Council's <u>Conservation Officer</u> has commented that there are concerns over the length of the extension however, it is less than the original proposal. They have further commented that the proposed extension appears sympathetically planned and designed although the projecting window seat would be at odds with the character of the other windows within the extension and the proposed solar panel could be quite visually intrusive. However, the extension in the proposed location should not affect the character or setting of the Listed Building.
- 3.3 <u>The Environment Agency</u> have assessed the proposed development as having a low environmental risk and therefore they have provided no further comments at this time.

3.4 <u>The Historic Environment</u> Unit have commented that the proposal is unlikely to have an impact upon significant archaeological deposits, structures or features.

### 4.0 Parish Council Representations

4.1 Widford Parish Council have no objections to the proposed development, subject to a condition that the proposed outbuilding would be used supplementary to the main dwelling.

### 5.0 Other Representations

5.1 The applications have been advertised by way of press notice, site notice and neighbour notification. No letters of representation have been received.

### 6.0 Policy

- 6.1 The relevant policies to these applications include:-
  - GBC3 Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt
  - ENV1 Design and Environmental Quality
  - ENV5 Extensions to Dwellings
  - ENV6 Extensions to Dwelling Criteria
  - ENV8 Residential Annexes
  - BH1 Archaeology and New Development
  - BH6 New Development in Conservation Areas
  - BH10 Extensions or Alterations to a Listed Building
  - BH12 Development Affecting the Setting of a Listed Building

## 7.0 <u>Considerations</u>

- 7.1 The relevant planning considerations in respect of these applications are:-
  - The principle of development;
  - The appropriateness of the proposed extensions to the character and appearance of the existing curtilage listed outbuilding and the setting of the Listed Building;
  - The impact of the overall development on the character and appearance of the Widford Conservation Area;
  - The impact on neighbour amenity;

### Principle of development

- 7.2 Policy GBC3 allows for appropriate forms of development within the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt which include limited extensions to dwellings. The proposed extension to the existing outbuilding is of an appropriate size and would be contained within the curtilage of the dwelling and therefore would not intrude upon the openness of the surrounding Rural Area. The proposed development would provide an appropriately sized annex that would be sited within close proximity to the dwelling. The proposed annex would form additional living accommodation to be used ancillary to the main dwelling and as such would be an appropriate use within the Rural Area.
- 7.3 Policy ENV5 expects outbuildings to be of a size and scale that by itself or cumulatively with other extensions would not disproportionately alter the size of the original dwelling. The proposed extension together with previous extensions to the dwelling would not be of an inappropriate size or scale and would not be disproportionate to the original dwelling or intrude upon the surrounding Rural Area.
- 7.4 Policy ENV8 of the Local Plan states that residential annexes will be permitted where the accommodation forms an extension to the main dwelling; is capable of being used as an integral part of the dwelling; has sufficient parking; and accords with policies ENV6 of the Local Plan.
- 7.5 The proposed annexe in this case, however, is detached from the main dwelling and does not form an extension to it as required by part a) of Policy ENV8. Whilst not forming an extension to the dwelling, Officers consider that the annexe would be sited in an appropriate location in relation to the main dwelling. Furthermore the sharing of the garden area, parking and access would ensure that a good relationship is maintained between the dwelling and the annexe. The use of the annexe would be for the purpose of housing live-in staff and therefore would remain dependent upon the existing dwelling. Should the applicant seek to use the annexe as a separate residential unit in the future then this would constitute a change of use and therefore further planning permission would be required.

The appropriateness of the proposed extension to the existing curtilage listed outbuilding and the setting of the Listed Building

7.6 The proposed extension to the existing outbuilding is considered to be acceptable. It is acknowledged that the existing outbuilding is curtilage listed however, the proposed extension would be situated at the rear of the existing outbuilding and would be well screened by mature landscaping. The Council's Conservation Officer has commented that the proposed

residential annexe is well planned and sympathetically designed and that the proposed extension should not effect the character or setting of the Listed Building. These comments have been duly noted and it is considered that the proposed extension would represent a modest addition to the existing outbuilding which would not be detrimental to its character and appearance, in accordance with policies ENV1, ENV5 and BH10.

7.7 In respect of the impact of the proposed development on the setting of the Listed Building, the proposed extension to the existing outbuilding would be set approximately 10 metres away from the Grade II Listed Building. Mature boundary treatment along the front of the Listed Building would largely screen views of the proposed extension from the Listed Building and surrounding street scene, reducing the overall impact of the proposed extension on the setting of the Listed Building. It should be noted that the proposed extension to the existing outbuilding. As such, it is considered that the proposed extension to the outbuilding would not be detrimental to the setting of the Listed Building would not be detrimental to the setting of the Listed Building with policy BH12.

### Impact on Conservation Area

7.8 Taking the above considerations into account, it is considered that the proposed extension to the existing outbuilding would not be detrimental to the character and appearance of the surrounding Conservation Area, in accordance with policy BH6.

### Neighbour amenity

7.9 The principle consideration in respect of assessing neighbour impact relates to the additional activity that would be created by converting the existing outbuilding and proposed extension into residential accommodation, and whether this would be detrimental to the general amenity of the existing occupiers and adjoining neighbouring occupiers. The property known as Goddards is set within its grounds with a large garden area and mature landscaping around the boundary of the site. The proposed extension to the existing outbuilding would be set approximately 10 metres away from the main dwelling and the existing outbuilding is set back from the adjacent neighbour at Little Goddards Cottage, North of the application site. It is considered that the resulting level of accommodation would not be detrimental to the amenity of the existing occupiers and adjoining neighbouring occupiers. It is considered that the proposed residential annexe would sufficiently set back the adjacent neighbouring dwelling to prevent any detrimental impact.

7.10 With regards to parking within the site, County Highways have commented that there would be sufficient parking available within the site to accommodate the existing and proposed accommodation; as such they do not wish to restrict the grant of planning permission. It is considered that the level of parking available would be sufficient for the level of accommodation being provided, in accordance of the aims of policy ENV8.

# 8.0 <u>Conclusion</u>

8.1 The proposed residential annexe would not have a significantly detrimental impact on the setting of the listed building or the amenity of adjoining neighbouring properties within the vicinity of the site. The proposed extension to the curtilage listed outbuilding would not have a significantly detrimental impact on the historic or architectural qualities that merit the listing of this building, furthermore they are designed sympathetically to the character and appearance of the existing outbuilding. Taking into account the above considerations, the proposal will also be sympathetic to the character and appearance of the Widford Conservation Area. In accordance with the above considerations it is recommended that planning permission and listed building consent are granted subject to the conditions at the head of this report.